



## Consultation Process-Stakeholders Dialogue Framework for Economic Growth of Pakistan



## Executive Summary of Quetta Workshop

University of Balochistan, Quetta  
October 15<sup>th</sup>, 2011

# **Framework for Economic Growth of Pakistan**

**“Stakeholders Dialogue”**

**Organized by the University of Balochistan, Quetta**

**In Collaboration with Planning Commission of Pakistan, Governance Institutes Network International (GINI) and Department of International Development (DFID)-UK**

**October 15<sup>th</sup>, 2011**

## **Executive Summary of Quetta Workshop Proceedings**

The Quetta Workshop was the seventh stakeholders’ dialogue under the consultation process spreading over nine workshops involving all stakeholders for creating economic literacy and local ownership of the economic reforms under the Framework for Economic Growth of Pakistan formulated by the Planning Commission and approved by the National Economic Council. It was organized by the University of Balochistan, Quetta in collaboration with the Planning Commission of Pakistan, the Governance Institutes Network International (GINI) and DFID on 15<sup>th</sup> October, 2011 as per agenda at **Annex-I**. In view of security concerns, the Workshop was held at the Quetta Club Limited. Against the planned participation of 70, the workshop was attended by over 100 participants as per details at **Annex-II**. Selected press clippings of the stakeholders’ dialogue at Quetta are attached separately.

### **Inaugural Session**

The Vice Chancellor University of Balochistan, Quetta, Prof. Dr. Abdul Nabi in his inaugural address welcomed all the participants of the Workshop. He appreciated the efforts of the Governance Institute Network International (GINI) & Planning Commission of Pakistan and support from Department for International Developments (DFID) for providing an opportunity to the University of Balochistan, Quetta to organize a workshop on such an important issue i-e Framework for Economic Growth of Pakistan. He said the Framework for Economic Growth would play a vital role in the economic growth, prosperity and development of Pakistan. He stressed on the adoption of more practical approach in development and implementation of the framework by taking into account real problems and needs of Pakistan. Role of educational institutes with proper continuity and sustainability plans of implementation with a major shift in creating technical educational centers is required.

In the opening remarks by Mr. Ghulam Mohyuddin Marri, Member Infrastructure explained the main objectives of the Framework for Economic Growth of Pakistan. He said consultation & coordination process would help in refining the proposed framework. He requested the participants to lead & guide in the development and refinement of the proposed document presented in the workshop. The stakeholders’ input would be incorporated in the implementation of this strategy/framework. After 18th amendment in the Constitution, provincial role is enhanced in policy planning and making effective implementation plans. After devolution of many departments and ministries/subjects to provincial governments, it is now the responsibility of the provincial governments to manage resources and arrange financial and administrative structures. While briefly explaining the five main pillars of New Framework of Growth (NGF) viz Quality Governance, Energy, Creative Cities, Vibrant Markets and Energetic Youth & Community, Mr. Marri highlighted that:

1. National priorities and achieving the goals by changing old paradigm of growth and projects implementation in the government.
2. Resolving rent seeking behavior of civil bureaucracy and service delivery by public sector enterprises.
3. Creation of jobs for younger generation and population planning – need of the hour.
4. Accelerating growth and community engagements for having smooth cities; delivering all services to common citizen habituating in a city. Also create further city areas and make municipal services available to all the residents.

A 30 minutes video address by Dr. Nadeem ul Haque, Deputy Chairman Planning Commission of Pakistan explaining the rationale and salient features of the Framework for Economic Growth of Pakistan was screened for the participants before start of the stakeholders' dialogue.

### **Stakeholders' Dialogue**

The stakeholders' dialogue was conducted with brief background video presentation on each of the five themes followed by open discussion as given in the agenda. As a result of stakeholders' dialogue during the workshop, following key points of both consensus and contention emerged covering a series of key areas for follow-up implementation of the Framework for Economic Growth of Pakistan formulated by the Planning Commission:

1. Policy formulation for strategic planning is the role of governments. Role of society, media and judiciary and all service delivery orgs/enterprises must be defined by the government making clear cut directions for all the stakeholders. There are many such models of governance practiced in various countries best suiting their own cultural, human, societal and living environments. Develop capacity of regulatory authorities, accountability organizations, auditing, and watch on government by the stakeholders
2. Balochistan has a huge commercial and business space which requires compact planning in an innovative way with emphasis on HR development and conducive environments to curb the migration of youth potential/talent to other provinces/countries.
3. Lack of adequate technical knowledge has prevented optimum utilization of agricultural, mineral and marine resources of Balochistan. Local universities should play their due role through focus on research and technical education to train our youth for becoming potential farmers in agriculture as well as industrial entrepreneurs.
4. Proper awareness through knowledge and skills under WTO standards is required to remove barriers in export of fruit and fish.
5. Administrative and financial capacity of provincial governments through equitable distribution of resources needs to be built for effective implementation of devolved subjects under the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment.

6. Due attention is required for rural poor and agriculture growth. Balochistan mostly produces one crop in a year through use of TWs, which is being severely affected due to long electricity load shedding. Small hydel, wind and coal projects at local level must be undertaken on priority. Public awareness through media and inclusion of a Chapter in schools books/curriculum would help in conserving and economical use of power.
7. Focused approach would be needed in handling and initiating newer entrepreneurship suiting local conditions. Lower entry barriers through easy and soft loans and taxes rebate for business incubations. Venture capitalism through public-private joint ventures should be encouraged. The success stories of Silicon valley, California and Industrial Zones like in China should be adapted in our local industrial estates.

**Remarks/Leading Questions raised by the participants:**

1. Why focus on ethical values, which are fundamental to healthy growth of any society, is missing from our planning?
2. Why Government continues to attribute public sector failure to mis-management, when we have best talent and HR potential in our country?
3. Why legal provisions related to BODs in case of QESCO which are intended to safeguard stakeholders' interests have been circumvented for too long?
4. Who will ensure result based management in the public sector; the current state of affairs in steel mill, railways, WAPDA, PIA reflect on the criminal neglect by the Government
5. Why Senate which is true symbol of federalism is not being made effective- direct vote would enhance its functional status.
6. Why Council of Common Interest is not being allowed to take full control of policies and implementation of subjects listed in Part-II of the Federal Legislative List
7. Lack of basic infrastructure in regions like Dera Bugti which are major contributors towards gas and minerals has increased feelings of neglect in development. Immediate measures are needed in this regard.
8. While WAPDA is getting full subsidy from Federal and Provincial Governments for power supply to agriculture TWs on 24 hours basis, it provides electricity for only about 6 hours in a day which has severely affected agriculture growth
9. MPAs huge development grants have failed to achieve sustainable development/results
10. Why due attention is not given to our rural poor and agriculture growth?
11. We have to send our kids to Lahore, Karachi, Islamabad and Peshawar for better education in secure environment. Why local capacity for quality education is not being created?

12. How could we encourage entrepreneurship in our environment of non-security and non-availability of proper city spaces as well as starting capital investments from banking loans with interest as high as up to 20%.
13. There is a massive exploitation in our banking sector. About 100 billion Rupees are in the current accounts with banks in Balochistan whereas only Rs.100 million loans are operating currently.
14. Students are the upcoming future of government machinery. They are energetic but are seeking a positive leadership. What will be the future; what is our position in this region in future, security issues and insecure human life in our cities?
15. Sibi Law College has closed due to non-funding; who is responsible for education affordability for the rural poor?
16. We need to revisit the quota system for education and jobs verses merit system

### **Concluding Remarks**

In his concluding remarks, Prof. Qazi Tousif Akhtar, Former Chairman, Department of Economics, UoB summarized the stakeholders' dialogue on Framework for Economic Growth of Pakistan as follows:

1. NGF provides a rational approach to address our dismal economic picture. We have to own this new policy on "Framework for Economic Growth of Pakistan" and work for change of mind sets for its successful implementation with due consideration to stakeholders' suggestions in this regard. MDGs were also presented in the last decade but put in shelves.
2. Restrict the politicians not to disturb the economic policy – some disciplinary laws like Fiscal Disciplinary Law (FDL) be developed for implementing the economic policies.
3. Lack of contingency planning on the part of government
4. Formulation of clear cut policies on the part of government
5. Emphasis on outsourcing and economies of scales
6. Dealing effectively with the brain drain issue (at provincial as well as at national level)
7. Emphasis on result based management

8. Minimization of theft and distribution costs in energy sector (especially in the electricity sector).
9. Appointment of professional in energy sector departments
10. Management of subsidiaries in energy sector.
11. Targeted subsidiaries in place of untargeted subsidiaries to benefit the agriculture sector.
12. Introduction of specific lessons in the curricula regarding the management and conservation of energy.
13. Private sector involvement in the management of energy related projects
14. Change in the current policies to attract the national/international investors
15. Professionals should head the relevant departments
16. Local board of directors should be encouraged for energy producing and providing companies
17. Introduction of one window operation for national/international investors
18. Search for alternative forms of energies (e.g., wind, coal, solar)
19. Problems of undocumented economy
20. Greater emphasis upon Livestock/agriculture/minerals/fisheries (with particular reference to Balochistan's Economy)
21. Production of PhDs in Universities of Balochistan, Quetta in specific fields of Livestock/agriculture/minerals/fisheries
22. Giving awareness to farmers about WTO
23. Need for the continuous interaction/linkage between people from Balochistan and Planning Commission of the Pakistan.
24. Setting the target "Where we want to be in next 20 years"

25. Decentralization of resources

26. Lowering the entry barriers for investors

27. Promoting the main driver of the Growth that is “the Private Sector”

28. Introduction of Venture Capitalism..... Supporting the startups/new comers

29. Financial and managerial assistance to young people to start new ventures.

The stakeholder dialogue was ended with a vote of thanks by Mr. Muhammad Imran Ghaznavi Advisor Planning Commission of Pakistan. He thanked all the participants for their active and meaningful participation in the workshop and made it a successful event. He assured them that their ideas, suggestion and proposal would be given due consideration.

**Stakeholders Workshop  
Framework for Economic Growth of Pakistan  
University of Balochist, October 15<sup>th</sup>, 2011**

**PROGRAM**

<b>INAUGURAL SESSION</b>	
1000-1005	<b>Recitation of the Holy Quran</b> by Hafiz Naseer Jan
1005-1015	<b>Welcome Address</b> by Dr. Abdul Nabi, Vice Chancellor, University of Balochistan (UoB)
1015-1025	<b>Opening Remarks</b> by Mr. Ghulam Mohyuddin Marri, Member Infrastructure, Planning Commission of Pakistan
1025-1100	<b>Video Address</b> by Dr. Nadeem ul Haq, Deputy Chairman, Planning Commission
<b>Stakeholders Dialogue on Salient Aspects of Framework for Economic Growth of Pakistan</b>	
<b>Moderator / Chair:</b> Prof. Mr. Touseef Akhtar, Former Chairman, Department of Economics, UoB	
<b><u>Panelists from University of Balochistan:</u></b>	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Dr. Jan Muhammad, Director, IMS, UoB</li> <li>2. Mr. Mahfooz Ali Khan, Accountant General, Balochistan</li> <li>3. Mr. Pritum Kumar, St. Engineer (Generation) QESCO</li> <li>4. Mr. Muhammad Ibrahim Khilji, Management Associate, SMEDA</li> <li>5. Mr. Tariq Zahri, Deputy Commissioner, Quetta</li> <li>6. Dr. Muhammad Nawaz, Chairman, Department of Geography, UoB</li> <li>7. Prof. Abdul Rasheed, Chairman, Department of Commerce, UoB</li> </ol>	
<b><u>Panelists from Planning Commission:</u></b>	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Mr. Ghulam Mohyuddin Marri, Member Infrastructure</li> <li>2. Mr. Imran Ghaznavi, Advisor</li> <li>3. Dr. Haroon Sarwar Awan, Economist</li> <li>4. Dr. Muhammad Sabir Afridi, Economist</li> </ol>	
<b>1140-1200</b>	<b>TEA / COFFEE BREAK</b>
<b>1100-1140</b>	<b>Role of Government / Result Based Management in Public Sector / Civil Service Reforms</b>
1100-1105	Video Presentation
1105-1140	Open Discussion
<b>1200-1240</b>	<b>Energy and Power</b>
1200-1205	Video Presentation
1205-1240	Open Discussion
<b>1320-1420</b>	<b>LUNCH BREAK</b>
<b>1240-1320</b>	<b>Market Reforms &amp; Entrepreneurship</b>
1240-1245	Video Presentation
1245-1320	Open Discussion

<b>1420-1500</b>	<b>Urban Reform &amp; Connectivity</b>
1420-1425	Video Presentation
1425-1500	Open Discussion
<b>1500-1540</b>	<b>Youth &amp; Community Engagement</b>
1500-1505	Video Presentation
1505-1540	Open Discussion
<b>1540-1555</b>	<b>Concluding Remarks</b>
<b>1555-1600</b>	<b>Vote of Thanks by Mr. Imran Ghaznavi, Advisor Planning Commission</b>

**Stakeholders Workshop**  
**Framework for Economic Growth of Pakistan**  
**University of Balochistan, Quetta**  
**Venue: Quetta Club Ltd.**  
**15<sup>th</sup> October, 2011**  
**List of Participants**

<b>S. No.</b>	<b>Name</b>	<b>Designation</b>	<b>Organization</b>
<i>Panelists &amp; Organizers</i>			
1	Mr. Ghulam Mohyuddin Marri	Chief Guest	Planning Commission of Pakistan
2	Prof. Dr. Abdul Nabi Khan	Vice Chancellor	University of Balochistan, Quetta
3	Mr. Imran Ghaznavi	Advisor	Planning Commission of Pakistan
4	Dr. Haroon Sarwar Awan	Panelists	Planning Commission of Pakistan
5	Dr. Muhammad Sabir Afridi	Panelists	Planning Commission of Pakistan
6	Brig. (Retd.) Muhammad Saleem Wains	Consultant-	GINI, Islamabad
7	Mr. Mohammad Naseem Raja	Consultant-GINI	GINI, Islamabad
8	Mr. M Sajjad-Ul-Hassan	Consultant-GINI	GINI, Islamabad
9	Dr. Jan Muhammad	Director, IMS	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
10	Mr. Abdul Rasheed	Chairman Commerce Deptt.	Commerce Department-UoB, Quetta.
11	Mr. Ibrahim Khilji	Management Associate	SMEDA, Quetta.
12	Prof Tauseef Akhtar	Ex. Professor & Chairman Economic Deptt.	Economic Department-UoB, Quetta.
13	Dr. Mohammad Nawaz	Chairman	Deptt. Of Geography, UoB, Quetta
14	Mr. Mahfooz Ali Khan	Accountant General	Government of Balochistan

15	Mr. Pritum Kumar	St. Engineer (Generation),	QESCO, Quetta
16	Mr. Abdul Naeem Khan	Workshop Coordinator	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
17	Ms. Beenish Malik	Stage Secretary	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
18	Mr. Furqan-ul-Haq	Co-Organizer	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
<b><i>Participants from University of Balochistan</i></b>			
19	Mr. Sohail Ahmed Bazai	Director Geneal, Admin & HR	University of Balochistan, Quetta
20	Mr. Kehar Khan Khosro	Deputy Director- HR	University of Balochistan, Quetta
21	Mr. Akram Dost	Director Students Affairs	University of Balochistan, Quetta
22	Mr. Haider Shah	Assistant Professor	Department of Statistics
23	Mrs. Rifat Arshad	Chairperson, Economic Deptt.	Economic Department-UoB, Quetta.
24	Mrs. Bushra Wazir	Lecturer	Economic Department-UoB, Quetta.
25	Mr. Arbab M. Jahandad	Lecturer	Economic Department-UoB, Quetta.
26	Miss Nadia Khan	Lecturer	Economic Department-UoB, Quetta.
27	Dr. Jahangeer Achakzai	Asstt. Proff	Economic Department-UoB, Quetta.
28	Mr. Nadeem Malik	Asstt. Professor	Commerce Department-UoB, Quetta.
29	Mr. Muhammad Shafiq	Lecturer	Commerce Department-UoB, Quetta.
30	Mr. M.K.Bhatti	Asstt. Proff	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
31	Dr. Saubia Ramzan	Asstt. Prof	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
32	Dr. Jahanvash Karim	Lecturer	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
33	Ms Masooma Iram	Lecturer	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
34	Mr. Zubair Sharif	Lecturer	IMS-UoB, Quetta.

35	Ms Fauzia Sheikh	Lecturer	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
36	Dr. Mukhtar Uzma	Lecturer	Department of Computer Sciences, UoB, Quetta.
37	Mr. Qudrat Ullah	Visiting Faculty	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
38	Mr. Khurram Shahzad	Lecturer	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
39	Mr. Muhammad Gul	M.Phil. Student	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
40	Ms. Faiza Mir	Lecturer	Department of International Relation- UoB, Quetta.
41	Prof. Dr. Naheed Anjum Chaisti	Professor	Department of Political Science
42	Ms. Samia Faqir	Student	Economics Department-UoB, Quetta.
43	Ms. Sania Rehmat	Student	Economics Department-UoB, Quetta.
44	Mr. Badaruddin	Student	Economics Department-UoB, Quetta.
45	Mr. Javaid Ali	Student	Economics Department-UoB, Quetta.
46	Mr. Waqhiullah	Student	Economics Department-UoB, Quetta.
47	Ms. Lubina Dawood	Student	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
48	Mr. Inamullah Khan	Student	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
49	Ms. Rabia Nazir	Student	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
50	Ms. Zainab Baloch	Student	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
51	Mr. Nida Muhammad	Student	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
52	Mr. Tamoor Shah	Student	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
53	Mr. Danish Saleem	Student	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
54	Mr. Soban	Student	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
55	Hafiz Naseeb Jan	Student	IMS-UoB, Quetta.

56	Mr. Saleh mohammad Kasi	Coordinator	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
57	Sohail Ahmed	Student	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
58	Maqsood Khalil Lodhi	Student	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
59	Ms. Faiza Bakhtawar	Student	University Law College
60	Ms. Sana Raisani	Student	University Law College
61	Ms. Aisha Kakar	Student	University Law College
62	Mr. Amir Hamza	Director, Public Relations	University of Balochistan
63	Mir Shai Mazar Baloch	PSO to VC	University of Balochistan
64	Mr. Tamoor Shah	Student	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
65	Ms. Roohana Gul Kakar	Student	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
66	Mr. Abid Bazia	Admn. Officer	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
67	Mr. Adeel Ahmed	IT Expert	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
68	Mr. Muzammil Ahmed	IT Expert	IMS-UoB, Quetta.
<b><i>Particants from Media &amp; Journalism</i></b>			
69	Mr. Siddiq Baloch	Editor	Balochistan Express
70	Mr. Saleem Shahid	Bureau Chief	Dawn Quetta
71	Mr. Kamaran Mumtaz	Editor	Mashriq Quetta
72	Mr. Abdul Shakoor	Reporter	Associated Press of Pakistan (APP)
73	Shahzada Zulfiqar	Bureau Chief	Pakistan Today
74	Syed Ali Shah	Bureau Chief	Dawn TV Quetta
75	Mr. Ejaz Khan	Bureau Chief	Geo, Quetta

76	Mr. Javed Akhtar Khan	Bureau Chief	Pakistan Press International (PPI)
77	Mr. Sabir Awan	Reporter	Daily Jang
78	Mr. Yousaf Masih	Chairperson Media & Journalism	Media & Journalism
79	Mr. Suleman Raja	Asstt Prof	Media & Journalism, UoB, Quetta.
<b><i>Participants from Chamber of Commerce, Business &amp; Industry</i></b>			
80	Mr. Niaz Muhammad Khan	Ex-President Quetta Chamber of Commerce	Niaz Muhammad & Company
81	Sahabzada Mohammad Khan	Managing Director	Chiltan Ghee Mills, Quetta
82	Mr Kamal ud din Ahmed	Ex-President	Quetta Chamber of Commerce
<b><i>Participants from Unions &amp; NGOs</i></b>			
83	Mr. Shah Ali Bughti	President UoB Employee Association	University of Balochistan, Quetta
84	Mr. Naimat Ullah	Member, Employee Association	University of Balochistan, Quetta
85	Ms. Saniya Khawajakhail	Executive Finance Officer	Poverty Alleviation Balochistan
86	Mr. Khizer Hayat	Procurement Manager	Balochistan Foundation for Development
87	Mr. Safdar Hussain	Associate Director	IDSP, Pakistan
88	Miss Noreen Lahri	Associate Director	IDSP, Pakistan
89	Ms. Najeeba Syed	Program Manager	CYAAD
90	Mr. Rahim Kasi	Monitoring & Evaluation Officer	UNDP
<b><i>Participants from Financial Institutions</i></b>			
91	Mr. Abdul Malik Achakzai	Assistant Chief Manager	State Bank of Pakistan, Quetta
92	Ms. Faiza Hanif	Assistant Coordinator, Audit	National Bank of Pakistan, HO, Quetta.
93	Mr. Mohammad Ramzan	OG I	NBP, Quetta.

94	Sultan Hamid	MIS Officer	UBL
95	Ms. Saeeda Batool	Credit Officer	ZTBL
<b><i>Participants from Civil Society, Govt Officials, other Universities</i></b>			
96	Muhammad Shah Khan	Deputy Director	BUIITEMS
97	Mr. Ghulam Mustafa	Additional Commissioner Revenue	Govt. of Balochistan.
98	Ms. Rukhsana Ahmed Ali	Member	National Commission on Status of Women
99	Mr. Sameen Khan	Coordinator Students Affair	BUIITEMS
100	Syed Shah Mohammad	Manager University Advancement	BUIITEMS